



## **GUIDELINES**

**for students enrolled in the doctoral programme  
at the MAQSUT NARIKBAYEV UNIVERSITY Law School**

**2024**

This Guide includes the general requirements for doctoral studies and doctoral dissertation preparation within the educational programs of the MAQSUT NARIKBAYEV UNIVERSITY Law School.

Approved by the Decision of the Academic and Research Council (Protocol No. 164 of March 4, 2024)

Recommended by the Science Committee of the MAQSUT NARIKBAYEV UNIVERSITY Law School, Protocol No. 11 of February 24, 2025

Developed by PhD, Adjunct Assistant Professor, Chairman of the Science Committee of the MNU Law School A. Abylayuly and LLM, Teaching Professor E. Babajanyan.

## Content

|                    |   |    |
|--------------------|---|----|
|                    | Introduction  | 4  |
| <b>SECTION I.</b>  | <b>DOCTORAL STUDIES</b>   |    |
| Chapter 1.         | Procedure for confirming the research topic and academic advisors                             | 5  |
| Chapter 2.         | Theoretical training  | 5  |
| Chapter 3.         | Scientific internship   | 5  |
| Chapter 4.         | Teaching practice of doctoral students  | 6  |
| Chapter 5.         | Research practice of doctoral students  | 8  |
| <b>SECTION II.</b> | <b>RESEARCH WORK OF A DOCTORAL STUDENT</b>  |    |
| Chapter 6.         | Research tasks of a scientific consultant   | 10 |
| Chapter 7.         | Research Proposal   | 10 |
| Chapter 8.         | Draft Research I  | 11 |
| Chapter 9.         | Draft Research II   | 11 |
| Chapter 10.        | Peer-review   | 14 |
| Chapter 11.        | Admission to the dissertation defense (preliminary defense)                                   | 14 |
| <b>SECTION II.</b> | <b>RULES FOR COMPLETING A DISSERTATION FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (PhD)</b>       |    |
| Chapter 12.        | Scope of application  | 13 |
| Chapter 13.        | General provisions  | 13 |
| Chapter 14.        | Scope of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor in the profile | 15 |
| Chapter 15.        | Structure of the dissertation   | 15 |
| Chapter 16.        | Requirements for the structural elements of the dissertation                                  | 15 |
| Chapter 17.        | Rules for completing a dissertation   | 17 |
| Chapter 18         | Rules for using artificial intelligence in dissertation work                                  | 23 |
|                    | Application 1   | 24 |
|                    | Application 2   | 25 |
|                    | Application 3   | 26 |
|                    | Application 4   | 27 |
|                    | Application 5   | 28 |

## Introduction

PhD programs of the MAQSUT NARIKBAYEV UNIVERSITY Graduate School of Law are designed to develop a high level of professional knowledge, analytical and critical thinking, highly qualified research competencies and the ability to effectively cooperate in an international context.

To achieve this goal, the PhD program focuses primarily on the principle of learning through research. In this regard, research conducted by doctoral students within the framework of their doctoral dissertations serves as a tool for demonstrating the professional knowledge, research skills and views of doctoral students formed during their PhD program training.

Expected competencies:

- formulate and solve problems that arise during the implementation of research work;
- choose the necessary research methods based on the specific research objectives.
- process the results obtained, analyze and provide them in the form of completed research projects (research report, abstracts, scientific article, research proposal, scientific report, doctoral dissertation)
- apply modern information technologies in conducting scientific research;
- conduct research in accordance with research ethics and academic integrity.

Training in the doctoral program involves:

|  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| Theoretical training (including internships and internships) | 45              |
| ECTS Research and development (doctoral research work)       | 123 ECTS        |
| Dissertation writing   | 12 ECTS         |
| <i>Total:</i>  | <i>180 ECTS</i> |

## **SECTION I. DOCTORAL STUDIES**

### **Chapter 1. Procedure for fixing the research topic and scientific consultants**

The dissertation is carried out under the supervision of a scientific consultant from among the teaching staff of MAQSUT NARIKBAYEV UNIVERSITY and a foreign scientific consultant who has academic degrees (Candidate of Science, Doctor of Science, Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile) or academic degrees of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor of profile or doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctors by profile and who are specialists in the field of scientific research of the doctoral student.

The post-graduate Training Manager of the MNU Law School administers the procedure for assigning a doctoral student to a scientific consultant and selecting a research topic. During the first week of the academic year, the tutor-manager sends doctoral students to their corporate e-mails with information about MNU Law School research schools and the profiles of scientific consultants. A person who is included in the list of undesirable scientific supervisors and consultants by the Scientific Committee of the MNU Law School or by order of the Dean, as well as who does not speak the language in which the dissertation is supposed to be performed, cannot be appointed as a scientific consultant.

The doctoral student proposes the research topic together with the scientific adviser. The topic should be related to the research and specific tasks of a particular scientific school and correspond to the profile (scientific interests) of the scientific adviser. Research can also be commissioned by organizations and other interested parties. In this case, the research topic can be formed with their participation. When forming the research topic, it is necessary to take into account that the research results should be applicable in the framework of projects of scientific schools or in practice.

The tutor-manager forms an idea about the approval of topics, domestic and foreign scientific consultants of dissertations and submits them for approval to the Scientific Committee of the MNU Law School and the Academic and Research Council of the University. The order on approval of topics, scientific consultants and foreign scientific consultants of dissertations is issued until November 30 of the current year.

### **Chapter 2. Theoretical training**

Doctoral students receive theoretical (classroom) training in the following courses:

- Methods of scientific research: Qualitative research methods;
- Methods of scientific research: Quantitative research methods;
- Academic writing and scientific publications<sup>1</sup>;
- Advanced English for Legal Studies.

### **Chapter 3. Scientific internship**

The doctoral candidate determines the place and terms of the internship together with the supervisor and the MNU Law School. The duration of the internship is at least 30 calendar

---

<sup>1</sup> As part of the course 'Academic Writing and Scientific Publications,' doctoral students learn about the specifics of work related to the publication of scientific research results, namely: issues related to the selection and formulation of the topic of a scientific publication, the development of the content and structure of a scientific article; special methods of scientific research in the preparation of articles; choosing a publisher (including working with journals with a non-zero impact factor); communicating with the publisher; formatting a scientific publication, citing sources, and other aspects necessary for the successful testing of scientific conclusions in publications on the topic of the dissertation research.

days. The content of the internship program should correspond to the research profile of the doctoral student. The internship program for doctoral students is approved by the MNU Law School Science Committee. A doctoral student's internship is carried out by persons who have preliminary research results and / or publications on the research topic.

In order to improve the scientific base of the dissertation research, get advice from foreign specialists and work in leading libraries of the world, doctoral students in the framework of research work can be organized in foreign educational and scientific organizations once for the entire period of study lasting at least 30 calendar days.

Documentation support of the internship (business trip orders, cost estimates) is provided by the MNU Law School. The Science Committee of the MNU Law School considers applications of doctoral students for a foreign internship with mandatory criteria for the success of such an internship.

During the internship, the doctoral student:

- complies with the organization's charter, internal regulations, and other regulatory documents governing the internship and stay at the host partner university.
- visits libraries, gets acquainted with the electronic resources of the partner university
- attends lectures by leading scientists in relevant specialties;
- performs all tasks provided for in the internship program.
- collects practical and theoretical material on the problem under study.
- keeps records of completed work.

At the end of the internship, the doctoral candidate submits a written report on the results of the internship at the meeting of the Committee on Science. The Committee members decide on its approval, revision or rejection, as well as give recommendations on how to use the results of the internship when writing a dissertation. If the Committee decides that the doctoral student has not achieved the set internship goals, the Committee may recommend that the doctoral student return the funds spent on the internship.

### **Procedure for funding research internships**

Funding for research internships abroad **is provided for doctoral students studying under the state educational order.**

Funding of research internship expenses is made in accordance with the approved University budget for the corresponding academic year.

After approval by the Scientific Committee for a foreign internship, a draft cost estimate for a doctoral student's scientific internship is drawn up and coordinated with the interested departments of the University.

The amount of funding for a research internship includes flight/travel expenses, accommodation, medical insurance, and visa fees.

The amount of funding is set annually according to the standards of expenses for a doctoral student's research internship approved by the Chairman of the Management Board.

In case of exceeding the established norms, expenses are repaid at the expense of the doctoral student's own funds.

Within 5 working days upon arrival from the internship, the doctoral student must submit an advance report to the accounting department, with all documents confirming expenses attached.

In case of non-submission of documents, the unconfirmed / unused amount of expenses is subject to refund to the University's current account

### **Chapter 4. Teaching practice of doctoral students**

Teaching practice takes place for doctoral students for 10 weeks (45 hours), where 40 hours are passive, 5 – active. Each doctoral student is assigned a practice manager who supervises and directs the doctoral student's work. Passive hours include visiting the doctoral student's classes of teachers of the MNU Law School, performing assignments of the head of the practice, aimed at developing pedagogical skills, studying educational and methodological documentation.

A doctoral student can start attending classes of teachers of the MNU Law School before the formal start of teaching practice. A doctoral student attends classes not only of their practice leader, but also of other teachers to explore the maximum number of teaching methods and ways to organize work in the classroom. These hours are recorded by the doctoral student in the journal and confirmed by the signature of the teacher whose class was attended, or by the signature of the head of the practice - in case of completing assignments.

The number of passive hours of a doctoral student necessarily includes the development of their own unique course in Canvas. The course topic should correspond to the general direction of doctoral research of the doctoral student. Doctoral students are assigned the role of "Teacher" in the Canvas system and a new course will be assigned to them, where the doctoral student uploads the necessary materials to the system. Active hours include 3 classes for doctoral students. The doctoral student conducts the first lesson as a teaching assistant, the second — binary on an equal footing with the teacher, the third — completely independent. The result of teaching practice will be a presentation of the course developed by the doctoral student, as well as a report on the classes conducted.

For the defense, doctoral students provide:

- internship progress report with an application for a time log,
- description from the head of the practice,
- demonstrates a course in Canvas on the topic of dissertation research.

The report contains a description of teaching practice tasks, a description of classes attended with an analysis of the teaching methods studied, and a description of active hours spent with accompanying analysis. The recommended report size is 4-6 pages, the Arial font is 14, and the line spacing is 1.

Basic requirements for the presentation of the course model:

- The presentation duration is 10 minutes.
- the subject of the course is closely related to the topic of the doctoral student's dissertation research (it DOES NOT duplicate existing courses).
  - the course contains from 3 to 5 modules, from 2 to 4 control measures indicating the assessment criteria and weight distribution of assessments, a syllabus, as well as all the necessary materials;
    - All materials must be uploaded to Canvas.
    - the subject and content of the course should not duplicate the developments that were directed by the doctoral student in the framework of previously studied courses.

The defense of reports is carried out in a commission consisting of the faculty of the MNU Law School. The score is set by calculating the arithmetic mean of all the ratings of the commission members. Grades are announced to doctoral students at the end of listening to the reports of the current day. A doctoral student can appeal against the final assessment for completing a teaching internship.

*Criteria for evaluating the teaching practice of doctoral students:*

- doctoral student demonstrates an understanding of course logic and content development – 30%

- doctoral student demonstrates the ability to develop a form and criteria for evaluating control activities-15%
- the doctoral student's report is logically structured and contains an analysis of the teaching methods of three or more teachers, as well as a critical analysis of the classes attended – 30%
- doctoral student demonstrates self-reflection skills regarding the active hours spent writing the report and answering questions during the defense – 15%
- the doctoral candidate presents the materials logically, with the purity of speech and the use of professional terminology – 10%.

## **Chapter 5. Research practice of doctoral students**

Research practice is a type of extracurricular work organized for doctoral students to complete. For research practice, the main goal should be to conduct work relevant to doctoral research, which results in a significant contribution to the writing of the study. Doctoral students are sent for a research internship in the organization in accordance with the topic of the dissertation research. A doctoral candidate may be offered an internship organization by a University, or a doctoral candidate may suggest an organization of their choice.

The practice takes place offline. Online internships are allowed only in exceptional cases at the discretion of the Academic Quality Committee. The doctoral student visits the company according to the schedule agreed with the head of practice at the enterprise, but not less than 20 hours per week. The doctoral student fills out a practice diary, where the hours worked are supported by the signature of the head of the practice from the enterprise.

During the internship, the doctoral student studies the activities of the internship organization, performs tasks of the internship manager from the enterprise, gets acquainted with the relevant regulatory framework, works with the organization's materials on the topic of their dissertation research or close to it. Practical tasks are exclusively of a research nature and form a scientific vision of the doctoral student's research topic, as well as are aimed at making a significant contribution to the writing of a doctoral study.

During the internship, the doctoral student records all the work performed for high-quality reflection in the report. If a doctoral student is not given the opportunity to participate significantly in the work of the organization on the basis of practice, he/she is not involved in the work carried out, or the degree of his / her participation is insufficient to achieve a significant result, the doctoral student must promptly inform the management of the MNU Law School, after which the management may decide to redirect the doctoral student to another institution.

At the end of the practice, reports are protected. The recommended report size is 7-10 sheets, 14 Arial font, and 1 line spacing. The report contains a description of the types of work and tasks performed by the doctoral student during the internship, an analysis of general trends in the development of the relevant industry, a description of the contribution of completed tasks to writing dissertation research, a description of the supervisor from the internship organization, and a practice diary.

The defense of reports is carried out in a commission consisting of the faculty of the MNU Law School. The score is set by calculating the arithmetic mean of all the ratings of the commission members. Grades are announced to doctoral students at the end of listening to the reports of the current day. A doctoral student can appeal against the final assessment for completing a research internship.

*Criteria for evaluating the research practice of doctoral students:*

- doctoral student demonstrates a deep degree of study of theoretical materials on the topic of his dissertation research – 25%

- doctoral student demonstrates a high degree of study of practical materials on the topic of dissertation research – 25%
- the results of the research practice are significantly included in the current study – 35%
- the doctoral student's report is logically structured, contains a description of the content of the internship and the results of its completion – 15%

## **SECTION II. RESEARCH WORK OF A DOCTORAL STUDENT**

### **Chapter 6. Research tasks of a scientific consultant**

Control over the preparation of doctoral research is assigned to the scientific consultant. The work on the dissertation is carried out in strict accordance with the plan of scientific research. The work on the dissertation is carried out by the doctoral student together with the scientific adviser through participation in individual consultations. In addition, there are additional forms of research work of a doctoral student:

- participation in the organization and holding of scientific, scientific and practical conferences, round tables, discussions;
- participation in research competitions;
- completing a foreign internship;
- passing the research (production) program practical training (collecting practical material through conducting interviews, questionnaires, etc.);
- preparation of scientific publications on dissertations in conference proceedings and scientific journals.

In the process of preparing doctoral dissertations, the scientific consultant of the dissertation performs the following types of work:

- issues a task for completing a dissertation.
- provides assistance in developing a work schedule for the entire period of the dissertation;
- approves the doctoral student's research program;
- recommends to the doctoral candidate the necessary basic literature, reference and archival materials, standard projects and other sources on the topic.
- sets the schedule of consultations, during which it performs current monitoring of the doctoral student's compliance with the dissertation performance schedule;
- coordinates the work of doctoral students;
- provides assistance in writing scientific articles;
- plans scientific internships (including foreign ones) to collect additional foreign literature;
- checks the dissertation and its individual parts for borrowing.

Within the framework of individual consultations, the scientific consultant takes part in:

- development of the methodology of doctoral research;
- recommendations on literature and electronic resources.
- providing information on upcoming conferences and round tables;
- building a foreign internship program;
- help the doctoral student with specific questions.

Control over the work of scientific consultants with doctoral students is assigned to the Deputy Dean.

### **Chapter 7. Research Proposal: Defending the relevance of the dissertation topic**

At the end of the first year of study, the doctoral student prepares and submits a defense before the Research Proposal Committee on the topic of their research (see Application 1 for the structure and evaluation criteria). Research Proposal is prepared and defended in the same language as the dissertation research.

The commission must include at least one specialist in the field of dissertation preparation.

At the Research Proposal defense, a doctoral candidate can be asked questions about the content of the submitted document, which allow analyzing the level of knowledge of information on the research topic, as well as a vision of the overall structure and expected research results.

Research Proposal protection reflects only the content of the Research Proposal itself. During the Research Proposal defense, the Committee may recommend editing the dissertation topic within the framework of the doctoral candidate's chosen research area.

Based on the results of the Research Proposal defense, the MNU Law School Science Committee evaluates the doctoral candidate from 0 to 100 points by open discussion. If the Research Proposal was not defended and the doctoral candidate did not disclose mandatory aspects during the defense, the Science Committee may give a rating of "Unsatisfactory" (below 50 points; F). In this case, fail is considered an academic debt, and the doctoral student cannot be transferred to the next course of study. Re-protection of the Research Proposal can be assigned no earlier than in 1 month.

### **Chapter 8. Draft Research I Progress Report**

At the end of the second year of study, doctoral students undergo an intermediate control procedure in the form of a Draft Research I defense on the topic of dissertation research in the MNU Law School Science Committee (see Application 2 for the structure and evaluation criteria). Draft Research I is prepared and defended in the same language as the dissertation research. Draft Research I must consist of at least 50 percent of the doctoral thesis text.

The commission must include at least one specialist in the field of dissertation preparation.

Based on the results of the defense of the report, the doctoral student receives recommendations for improving scientific activities within the framework of the dissertation research. If the report was not defended and the doctoral candidate did not disclose mandatory aspects during the defense, the Science Committee may record a fail (below 50 points; F). In this case, fail is considered an academic debt, and the doctoral student cannot be transferred to the next course of study. The report can be re-protected no earlier than 1 month later. The degree of responsibility of a scientific adviser is considered by the Academic Quality Committee.

### **Chapter 9. Draft Research II Progress Report**

At the end of the third year of study, doctoral students undergo an interim control procedure in the form of a Draft Research II defense on the topic of dissertation research in the MNU Law School Science Committee (see Application 3 for the structure and evaluation criteria). Draft Research II is prepared and defended in the same language as the dissertation research. Draft Research II must consist of at least 80 percent of the doctoral thesis text.

The commission must include at least one specialist in the field of dissertation preparation.

If the report was not defended and the doctoral candidate did not disclose mandatory aspects during the defense, the Science Committee may record a fail (below 50 points; F). In this case, fail is considered an academic debt, and the doctoral student cannot be transferred to the next course of study. The report can be re-protected no earlier than 1 month later. The degree of responsibility of a scientific adviser is considered by the Academic Quality Committee.

### **Chapter 10. Peer-review**

At the end of the 3rd and 5th semesters, the Consultant-practitioner conducts peer-review studies and evaluates the volume and quality of work carried out by the doctoral student. The consultant-practitioner is appointed by the Scientific Committee not from among the teaching staff of the MNU Law School, whose educational profile and experience correspond to the topic of the dissertation.

The consultant-practitioner must have an academic degree: PhD, Candidate of Science or Doctor of Science.

Based on the results of the peer review, the Consultant prepares a review that reflects:

- sufficient amount of work done in relation to the requirements of this policy;
- the quality of the work done;
- quality of the Research Proposal project after studying the Methodology of scientific research (during the first year of study);
- quality of the prepared part of the dissertation research.

The doctoral student undertakes to make changes and correct errors found by the Consultant prior to the defense before the Science Committee at the end of each year. The degree of elaboration of the Consultant's comments and recommendations should be taken into account when evaluating the report in the Science Committee.

### **Chapter 11. Admission to the dissertation defense (preliminary defense)**

Admission to the defense of a dissertation research is granted to doctoral students during an extended meeting of the Committee on Science.

In the process of conducting the official pre-defense and defense of the dissertation, mandatory audio-video recording is carried out.

Requirements for organizing a meeting of the preliminary dissertation defense and making a decision on admission to the defense for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD):

- the doctoral student must master all educational credits planned according to the working curriculum of the educational program;
- the meeting is scheduled on the initiative of the doctoral student;
- the meeting must be attended by at least 2/3 of the members of the Science Committee;
- the meeting of the Science Committee must also be attended by the Head of the program in the relevant field, as well as at least 3 (three) invited specialists with sufficient scientific and / or practical experience, as well as able to contribute to the discussion of the dissertation; the doctoral student must submit to the meeting the completed dissertation work with the results of checking for illegal borrowing in StrikePlagiarism;
- the doctoral candidate must submit to the meeting the main scientific results of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), published in scientific publications included in the List of scientific publications recommended for publication of the main results of scientific activity and in an international peer-reviewed scientific journal<sup>2</sup>;
- the doctoral candidate must submit a review of a foreign scientific consultant to the meeting;
- the doctoral candidate must submit a review of the scientific adviser to the meeting. A dissertation can only be accepted for defense if the scientific consultant gives a positive review. The main aspects that should be presented in the review are: the scientific novelty of the provisions to be protected; the degree of scientific validity of the protected provisions; sufficient theoretical basis; sufficient empirical data confirming the relevance of the protected provisions; compliance with the principles of academic integrity and research ethics; proper design, including compliance with the required citation style. As part of the review of the dissertation, the scientific consultant is presented with one of two options: 1) recommend for public defense; 2) do not recommend for public defense.

The dissertation must be sent to the Secretary of the Scientific Committee of the MNU Law School no later than 10 working days before the start of the official public defense procedure.

---

<sup>2</sup> Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of the Rules for Awarding Degrees" dated March 31, 2011, No. 127, <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1100006951>

When making a decision on admission to the public defense, the Science is guided by the following criteria:

- scientific novelty of the provisions to be protected;
  - the degree of scientific validity of the protected provisions;
  - sufficient theoretical basis, analyzed in the course of the dissertation research;
  - availability of empirical data confirming the relevance and validity of the protected provisions;
- provisions;
- compliance with the rules of academic integrity and prevention of illegal borrowing in the research text;
  - appropriate technical design of the work, including correct citation.

If the Scientific Committee considers that the dissertation research does not meet one of the above criteria, the doctoral candidate may be recommended to carry out additional work on the research in order to achieve compliance with the criteria for admission to the public defense. A repeated extended meeting of the Committee is held at the request of the doctoral student to correct or supplement the dissertation research and is conducted according to the same criteria as the primary one, and also includes a comparative analysis of the work done according to the recommendations developed earlier.

Appeal. If an appeal is submitted to the Science Committee for a given assessment within the framework of any event, the composition of the appeal commission is formed by the Science Committee in cooperation with the office of the Dean of the MNU Law School.

## **SECTION III. RULES FOR COMPLETING A DISSERTATION FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (PhD)**

### **Chapter 12. Scope of application**

These Rules set out general requirements for the structure, scope and rules of registration of doctoral dissertations (hereinafter referred to as dissertations) submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD).

### **Chapter 13. General provisions**

The dissertation is carried out in compliance with the principles of independence, internal unity, scientific novelty, reliability and practical value:

1. *The principle of independence* – a dissertation must be written personally by its author and indicate the personal contribution of the author of the dissertation to science.

2. *The principle of internal unity* – the dissertation should have an internal unity, all sections and provisions of the dissertation should be logically interrelated; scientific provisions, results obtained and recommendations should correspond to the goals and objectives set in the dissertation. The new solutions proposed by the author should be reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions.

3. *The principle of scientific novelty* – all scientific results, provisions, recommendations and conclusions of the dissertation must be new. From the standpoint of novelty, the dissertation should contain:

- new scientifically based theoretical and (or) experimental results, the totality of which qualifies as a new scientific achievement or is important for the development of specific scientific areas;

- or scientifically based technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions, the implementation of which makes a significant contribution to the development of the country's economy.

4. *The principle of reliability* – the results of the dissertation work should be obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of data processing and interpretation using computer technologies.

5. *The principle of practical value of a dissertation* – a dissertation of applied significance contains information about the practical use of scientific results obtained by the author, confirmed by author's certificates, patents and other official documents, and a dissertation of theoretical significance contains recommendations on the use of scientific conclusions.

6. *The principle of academic integrity* means that the dissertation author respects the rights and legitimate interests of other authors:

- no use and / or assignment of the text, ideas, hypotheses, conclusions, methods, research results, graphs, codes, images or works of other authors without reference to the author and source of borrowing, as well as the use of other authors' text by synonymous substitution of words and expressions without changing the meaning, including the use of text translated from another language (plagiarism).

- lack of facts of using your own material, factual and digital data without reference to yourself and / or the source of your own quotes (auto-plagiarism);

- links to non-existent sources, providing unreliable data and / or results, records, or reports about them (fabrication).

- the presence of manipulation of research materials, equipment, images, illustrations or processes, as a result of which the research materials in the dissertation are distorted (falsification).

Coincidence of the names of normative legal acts and official documents, names of state and other official bodies and organizations, terms, definitions and concepts generally accepted

for the relevant branch of science, texts of normative legal acts, texts of works under study is not considered plagiarism, if the volume and nature of their use do not call into question the independence of the dissertation performed. It is not allowed to use technical means and techniques in order to reduce or eliminate the possibility of detecting plagiarism.

The dissertation may include the results of questionnaires, surveys, and other types of empirical research. If the dissertation author plans to conduct a survey or questionnaire, he / she should send the research format and list of questions previously agreed with the supervisor to the Scientific Committee of the MNU Law School. Approval by the Committee is a prerequisite for conducting such a study.

#### **Chapter 14. Scope of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), doctor by profile**

The dissertation should be at least 150 pages long. Applications are not included in the specified volume of the dissertation.

#### **Chapter 15. Structure of the dissertation**

The structural elements of the dissertation are:

- title page;
- content;
- regulatory references.
- definitions.
- symbols and abbreviations.
- introduction;
- the main part;
- conclusion;
- list of sources used.
- applications.

#### **Chapter 16. Requirements for the structural elements of the dissertation**

##### *Title page*

The title page is the first page of the dissertation and serves as a source of information necessary for processing and searching the document. The title page is included in the general page numbering of the dissertation. The page number is not included on the title page. The title page is drawn up in accordance with Application 4. The title page must contain the doctoral student's personal signature in black ink.

The title page contains the following information:

- name of the organization where the dissertation was performed.
- Universal Decimal Classification Index (UDC).
- restrictive neck (if necessary).
- last name, first name, patronymic of the dissertation candidate;
- name of the work;
- code and name of the educational program.
- the required degree.
- surname and initials of scientific consultants;
- place and date (year).

##### *Content of the dissertation*

The content of the dissertation includes the introduction, sequence numbers and names of all sections, subsections, paragraphs (if they have names), the conclusion, the list of sources used and the name of Applications indicating the page numbers from which these elements of

the dissertation begin.

#### *Regulatory references*

The structural element "Normative references" contains a list of standards that are referenced in the text of the dissertation. The list of reference standards begins with the words: "References to the following standards are used in this dissertation." The list includes standard designations and their names in ascending order of registration numbers of designations.

#### *Definitions*

The structural element "Definitions" contains definitions that are necessary to clarify or establish the terms used in the dissertation. The list of definitions begins with the words: "In this dissertation, the following terms are used with the corresponding definitions."

#### *Symbols and abbreviations*

The structural element "Designations and abbreviations" contains a list of designations and abbreviations used in the dissertation. Notations and abbreviations should be written in the order in which they appear in the text of the dissertation or in alphabetical order with the necessary interpretation and explanations. Definitions, designations, and abbreviations may be combined in a single "Definitions, Designations, and Abbreviations" structural element.

#### *Introduction*

The introduction should contain an assessment of the current state of the scientific or scientific-technological problem (s) being solved, the basis and initial data for developing the topic, justification for the need to conduct this research work, information about the planned scientific and technical level of development, patent research and conclusions from them, information about the metrological support of the dissertation. The introduction should show the relevance and novelty of the topic, the relationship of this work with other research works, as well as the goals, object and subject, research objectives, their place in the implementation of research work in general, reflect the methodological base, provisions submitted for defense.

#### *The main part*

The main part of the dissertation provides data reflecting the essence, methodology and main results of the work performed.

The main part should contain:

- the process of theoretical and (or) experimental research, including determining the nature and content of theoretical research, research methods, calculation methods, justification of the need for experimental work, principles of operation of the developed objects, their characteristics;
- generalization and evaluation of research results, including an assessment of the completeness of the solution of the problem and suggestions for further areas of work, an assessment of the reliability of the results obtained and their comparison with similar results of domestic and foreign works.

Each section of the dissertation should end with the main conclusions and form the basis for the next section.

The presentation in the main part of the dissertation should be strictly justified, complete and logical. Spelling, grammatical and punctuation errors should not be allowed in the dissertation. The style of presentation of the dissertation text should be correct from a scientific point of view. No one's emotional judgments and statements, expressions from fiction, everyday expressions, jargon, etc. are allowed.

#### *Conclusion*

The conclusion should contain:

- brief conclusions based on the results of the dissertation research;
- assessment of the completeness of solutions to the assigned tasks;
- recommendations and initial data on the specific use of the results.
- assessment of the scientific level выполненной of the work performed in comparison with the best achievements in this field.

### *List of sources used*

The list should contain information about the sources used in writing the dissertation.

### *Applications*

It is recommended that the Applications include materials related to the completed dissertation, which for some reason cannot be included in the main part. Applications can include:

- intermediate mathematical proofs, formulas, and calculations.
- tables of auxiliary digital data;
- test reports;
- description of the equipment and devices used in conducting experiments, measurements and tests;
- rules and methods, descriptions of algorithms and programs for computer-generated tasks developed during the dissertation process;
- illustrations (photos).
- minutes of consideration of the dissertation work (or part of it) at the scientific and technical council;
- acts of implementation of the results of the dissertation work, etc.
- draft legislative acts, concepts, and other documents.

## **Chapter 17. Rules for completing a dissertation**

### *General requirements*

Presentation of the text and design of the dissertation is performed in accordance with the requirements of these Rules. The pages of the dissertation text and the illustrations and tables included in the dissertation must correspond to the A4 format.

The dissertation should be completed using a computer and a printer on one side of a sheet of white A4 paper with one interval using Arial the black Arial font, size 14. The text of the dissertation should be printed with the following margins: right – 20 mm, top – 20 mm, left – 30 mm and bottom – 20 mm.

It is allowed to use computer capabilities to focus attention on certain terms, formulas, and theorems, using fonts of different typefaces. The quality of the printed text and the design of illustrations, tables, and printouts from a PC must meet the requirement for their clear reproduction.

When performing a dissertation, it is necessary to observe uniform density, contrast and clarity of the image throughout the dissertation. The dissertation should contain clear lines, letters, numbers and signs that are not blurred.

Surnames, organization names, product names, and other proper names are given in the original language in the dissertation.

It is allowed to transliterate proper names and give the names of organizations translated into the language of the dissertation with the addition (at the first mention) of the original name.

### *Building a dissertation*

Names of structural elements of the dissertation "Content", "Normative references", "Definitions", "Designations and abbreviations", "Introduction", "Conclusion",

"List of sources used", "Application" *SERVE* as the headings of the structural elements of the dissertation. Structural elements should be highlighted in bold.

The main part of the dissertation should be divided into sections, subsections and

paragraphs. Items can be divided into sub-items, if necessary. When dividing the dissertation text into paragraphs and sub-paragraphs, it is necessary that each paragraph contains complete information.

Sections and subsections must have headings. Items usually don't have headings. Headings should clearly and concisely reflect the content of sections and subsections. Headings of sections, subsections and paragraphs should be printed with a paragraph indent with a capital letter without a dot at the end, without underlining. If the title consists of two sentences, separate them with a dot. For an example of the content of a dissertation, see Application 5.

#### *Page numbering of the dissertation*

The pages of the dissertation should be numbered in Arabic numerals, observing the end-to-end numbering throughout the text of the dissertation. The page number is placed in the center of the lower part of the sheet without a dot. The title page is included in the general page numbering. The page number is not included on the title page. Illustrations and tables located on separate sheets are included in the general page numbering of the dissertation. Illustrations and tables on an A3 sheet are counted as one page.

#### *Numbering of sections, subsections, paragraphs, sub-paragraphs*

Sections of the dissertation should have ordinal numbers within the entire work, indicated by Arabic numerals without a dot and written with paragraph indentation. Subsections should be numbered within each section. The subsection number consists of the section and subsection numbers separated by a dot. Don't put a dot at the end of the subsection number. Sections, like subsections, can consist of one or more items.

If the dissertation does not have subsections, then the numbering of items in it should be within each section, the item number should consist of the section and item numbers separated by a dot. Don't put a dot at the end of the item number.

If the dissertation has subsections, then the numbering of items should be within the subsection and the item number should consist of the section, subsection and item numbers separated by dots.

If a section consists of a single subsection, then the subsection is not numbered. If the subsection consists of one item, then the item is not numbered.

If the text is divided only into paragraphs, then they are numbered by ordinal numbers within the entire dissertation.

If necessary, items can be divided into sub-items, which should have an ordinal numbering within each item, for example: 4.2.1.1, 4.2.1.2, etc.

Enumerations can be provided inside items or sub-items.

Each enumeration should be preceded by a hyphen or, if necessary, a reference in the document text to one of the enumerations, a lowercase letter (with the exception of e, z, y, o, h, b, s, b), followed by a parenthesis.

For further details of enumerations, you must use Arabic numerals, followed by a parenthesis, and the entry is made with paragraph indentation.

If the dissertation consists of two or more parts, each part must have its own sequence number. The number of each part should be placed in Arabic numerals on the title page under the type of dissertation work, for example, "Part 2".

Each structural element of the dissertation (Chapter 15.) should start with a new sheet (page).

The pages of the dissertation and its Applications should be numbered end-to-end.

#### *Illustrations*

Illustrations (drawings, maps, graphs, diagrams, computer printouts, diagrams, photographs) should be placed in the text of the dissertation immediately after the text in which they are mentioned for the first time, or on the next page. Illustrations can be computer-generated, including color ones. All illustrations should be referenced in the thesis.

Drawings, graphs, diagrams, diagrams, and illustrations placed in dissertations must meet the requirements of the state standards of the Unified System of Design Documentation (ESKD). It is allowed to create drawings, graphs, diagrams, and diagrams using computer printing.

Illustrations, with the exception of illustrations of Applications, should be numbered in Arabic numerals, end-to-end numbering. The word "Drawing" and its name are placed in the middle of the line.

Illustrations, if necessary, can have a name and explanatory data (pictorial text). The word "Drawing" and its name are placed after the explanatory data and arranged as follows: Figure 1-Device details.

If the drawing is located on more than one page, then place the number and name of the drawing on the first sheet (page) with the designation of its sheet, on subsequent pages indicate only the number of the drawing and sheet. (Example: Figure 1-Device details, sheet 1; Figure 1, Sheet 2)

It is allowed to number illustrations within the section. In this case, the illustration number consists of the section number and the sequence number of the illustration, separated by a dot. For example, Figure 1.1. Illustrations of each application are designated by separate numbering in Arabic numerals with the addition of the application designation before the digit. For example, Figure A.3. Illustrations should be drawn up in accordance with Application B.

When referring to illustrations, write "...in accordance with Figure 2" for end-to-end numbering and "...in accordance with Figure 1.2" for numbering within a section.

#### *Tables*

Tables are used for better visibility and ease of comparison of indicators. The name of the table should reflect its content, be accurate and concise. The table name should be placed above the table on the left, without paragraph indentation, in one line with its number separated by a dash. The table should be placed in the dissertation immediately after the text in which it is mentioned for the first time, or on the next page. All tables should be referenced in the thesis. When linking, write the word "table" with its number.

You can move a table with a large number of rows to another sheet (page). When transferring a part of a table to another sheet (page), the word "Table", its number and name are indicated once on the left above the first part of the table, and above other parts also on the left write the words "Continuation of the table" and indicate the table number, for example: "Continuation of table 1". When moving a table to another sheet (page), the header is placed only over the first part of the table.

A table with a large number of graphs can be divided into parts and placed one part under the other within the same page. If the rows and columns of the table go beyond the page

format, then in the first case, the head is repeated in each part of the table, and in the second case, the side bar is repeated.

If the text repeated in different columns of the table consists of a single word, then it can be replaced with quotation marks after the first writing; if it consists of two or more words, then it is replaced with the words "The same" at the first repetition, and then with quotation marks. You can't use quotation marks instead of repeating numbers, stamps, signs, mathematical or chemical symbols. If numeric or other data is not shown in any row of the table, then put a dash in it.

Column "No." in order, if necessary, is given, in other cases – is absent.

Table \_- \_ number tables name

|  |  |  |  |  |  |   |                 |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|---|-----------------|
|  |  |  |  |  |  | } | Column headings |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |   | }               |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | } |                 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |   | }               |

Tables, with the exception of tables in appendices, should be numbered consecutively using Arabic numerals. Tables may be numbered within a section. In this case, the table number consists of the section number and the sequential table number, separated by a full stop.

Tables of each application are designated by separate numbering in Arabic numerals with the addition of the application designation before the digit.

The headings of graphs and table rows should be written with a capital letter in the singular, and the subheadings of graphs should be written with a lowercase letter if they form a single sentence with the title, or with a capital letter if they have a separate meaning. Don't put dots at the end of table headings and subheadings.

Tables on the left, right, and bottom are bounded by lines. You can use a font size in the table that is smaller than in the text.

You can't use diagonal lines to separate the titles and subheadings of the sidebar and graph.

Do not draw horizontal and vertical lines separating the rows of the table, if their absence does not make it difficult to use the table.

Graph headers are written parallel to the table rows. If necessary, the graph headers can be positioned perpendicular to each other. The head of the table should be separated by a line from the rest of the table.

#### *Notes*

The word "Note" should be capitalized from the paragraph and not underlined. Notes are given in the dissertation if explanations or reference data are needed to the content of the text, tables or graphic material. Notes should not contain any requirements.

Notes should be placed directly after text or graphic material, or in the table to which these notes relate. If there is only one note, then put a dash after the word "Note" and the note is printed with a capital letter. One note is not numbered. Several notes should be numbered in order using Arabic numerals without a dot. A note to the table is placed at the end of the table above the line indicating the end of the table.

If an additional explanation is required in the dissertation, the note can be made out in the form of a footnote. The footnote sign is placed immediately after the word, number, symbol, or sentence that is being explained. Make the footnotes superscript with Arabic numerals and a parenthesis. You can use asterisks "\*" instead of numbers for footnotes. The footnote should be placed at the end of the page with a paragraph indent, separated from the text by a short horizontal line on the left. A footnote to the table is placed at the end of the table above the line indicating the end of the table.

#### *Citation (links)*

When writing a dissertation research, the design of footnotes with sources is carried out by applying the citation style Oxford University Standard for the Citation of Legal Authorities (OSCOLA), 4th edition.

#### *Definitions, designations, and abbreviations*

The list of definitions, notations, and abbreviations should be arranged in a column. Abbreviations, symbols, symbols, units of physical quantities, and terms are listed on the left in order of reference or in alphabetical order. On the right - their full interpretation.

#### *List of sources used*

The list of sources used depends on the chosen citation style.

### *Applications*

Applications are designed as a continuation of the dissertation on its subsequent pages. All Applications should be referenced in the dissertation text. Applications are placed in the order of references to them in the text of the dissertation. Each application should start with a new page with the words at the top in the middle of the page

"Application", its designations. The text of each Application, if necessary, can be divided into sections, subsections, paragraphs, sub-paragraphs, which are numbered within each Application. The number is preceded by the designation of this application. Applications should have end-to-end page numbering in common with the rest of the dissertation.

## **Chapter 18. Rules for the use of artificial intelligence in dissertation work**

The preparation of a dissertation allows the use of artificial intelligence (AI) technologies, but such use is possible only within the established principles of independence, academic integrity, reliability and ethics. AI is considered solely as an auxiliary tool that can improve the effectiveness of individual research stages, but not replace the intellectual contribution of the author. The use of AI is possible only after prior agreement with a scientific consultant.

The use of AI is acceptable at the stage of preliminary preparation of materials, including data collection, categorization, and initial processing. AI technologies can also be used for statistical information processing, modeling, or enhancing analytical tools, provided that the author independently forms conceptual positions, interpretations, and scientific conclusions. At the stage of writing text, AI can be used to improve readability, style, and language design, but not to create meaningful fragments, formulate hypotheses, conclusions, or justifications.

The use of AI requires full compliance with the principle of academic integrity. The author must openly and transparently report on the use of AI. The dissertation work should include the name of the tool used, the manufacturer, version, and date of access, as well as a description of the stages at which the AI was used and how it was used. The author should also explain methods for verifying the validity of data obtained or processed using AI. The absence of such information means confirmation that AI was not used in the work.

It is unacceptable to use AI to generate scientific statements, primary results, author's conclusions, or other intellectual products that should be the result of independent scientific work of a doctoral student. It is prohibited to use AI in order to conceal plagiarism, syntactically modify borrowed texts, fabricate or falsify data, as well as in works containing restricted access information or classified as classified. Special restrictions apply when working with personal data, especially in research projects related to children under 13 years of age.

The author is responsible for the correctness and completeness of the information provided, as well as for compliance by all participants in the process with the established standards. The author must ensure the accuracy, validity and verifiability of all results, provide a transparent methodology for working with AI, and prevent violations of the rights and legitimate interests of third parties.

**RESEARCH PROPOSAL REQUIREMENTS**

| <b>No</b> | <b>RESEARCH PROPOSAL should consist of the following sections:</b>   | <b>Points</b> |
|-----------|--|---------------|
| 1         | <b>DISSERTATION RESEARCH PLAN</b><br>In this section, doctoral students present the dissertation research plan (content).  | 20 points     |
| 2         | <b>INTRODUCTION</b><br><ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Formulation of research problems on which the dissertation research will be based.</li> </ul> Purpose and objectives of the dissertation research.   | 20 points     |
| 3         | <b>LITERATURE REVIEW</b><br>In this section, doctoral students must show that they are familiar with the research conducted in the field of the dissertation research topic. In particular, doctoral students show: basic theories; research methods; and discussions in the field. The literature review should not become a retelling of other works. Doctoral students need to analyze the work of other authors in the context of the chosen problem. In particular, doctoral students should: identify the main literature; compare several visions for the selected problem. | 50 points     |
| 4         | <b>TERMS OF WRITING A DISSERTATION</b><br>In this section, doctoral students determine the specific terms of writing each of the sections of the dissertation.   | 5 points      |
| 5         | <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b><br>It is necessary to list all the sources used.   | 5 points      |

**DRAFT RESEARCH I REQUIREMENTS**

| <b>№</b> | <b>DRAFT RESEARCH I must consist of:</b>   | <b>Points</b> |
|----------|--|---------------|
| 1        | At least 50 percent of the text of the doctoral dissertation, designed in accordance with Section III of this Manual:<br>Title page<br>Contents<br>Text of the dissertation (introduction, sections and subsections)<br>Bibliography | 80<br>points  |
| 2        | At least one publication of the article in the journal that meets the requirements of the Rules for awarding Degrees of the Republic of Kazakhstan, or the finished text of one published article.                                   | 20<br>points  |

**REQUIREMENTS FOR DRAFT RESEARCH II**

| <b>№</b> | <b>DRAFT RESEARCH II must consist of:</b>   | <b>Points</b> |
|----------|---|---------------|
| 1        | At least 80 percent of the text of the doctoral dissertation, designed in accordance with Section III of this Manual:<br>Title page<br>Contents<br>Introduction<br>Text of completed two sections<br>Bibliography | 80<br>points  |
| 2        | At least two publications published in journals that meet the requirements of the Rules for awarding Degrees of the Republic of Kazakhstan.   | 20<br>points  |

MAQSUT NARIKBAYEV UNIVERSITY

UDC On the rights of the manuscript

**LAST NAME, FIRST NAME, PATRONYMIC THESIS TOPIC**  
Code and name of the educational program

Dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

Scientific consultant

Full name, academic degree, academic title

Republic of Kazakhstan Astana, year

## Content

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS</b>  | 4                                       |
| <b>INTRODUCTION</b>   | 5                                       |
| <b>1 INTERNATIONAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE RIGHT TO HIGHER EDUCATION</b>  | 12                                      |
| 1.1 Legal consolidation of the right to education: theoretical and historical aspect  | 12                                      |
| 1.1.1 History of the formation and legal consolidation of the right to education  | 12                                      |
| 1.1.2 The concept of the right to higher education  | 20                                      |
| 1.2 The right to higher education in universal and regional international treaties  | 26                                      |
| 1.2.1 Universal contractual and legal bases of the right to higher education  | 26                                      |
| 1.2.2 Regional contractual and legal bases of the right to higher education   | 34                                      |
| 1.2.3 Interaction of international law and national law of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of the right to higher education               | 40                                      |
| 1.3 Conclusions on section I  | 46                                      |
| <b>2 LEGAL REGULATION OF INTERACTION OF STATES IN THE FIELD OF HIGHER EDUCATION WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF UNIVERSAL INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS</b> | 49                                      |
| 2.1 Legal framework for UNESCO's higher education activities  | 49                                      |
| 2.2 WTO rules in the provision of educational services  | 55                                      |
| 2.2.1 GATS and higher education   | 55                                      |
| 2.2.2 GATS and branches of foreign universities   | 60                                      |
| 2.3 Conclusions on Section II   | 63                                      |
| <b>3 REGIONAL CONTRACTUAL and LEGAL REGULATION of INTERSTATE RELATIONS IN the FIELD OF HIGHER EDUCATION</b>                                       | 65                                      |
| 3.1 Legal basis for the functioning of common educational spaces  | 65                                      |
| 3.1.1 Common Educational space in the Eurasian space: current realities and legal framework practice  | 66                                      |
| 3.1.2 Legal nature of the EHEA – Bologna Process  | fra<br>m<br>e<br>w<br>o<br>r<br>k<br>70 |

|          |  |            |
|----------|--|------------|
| 3.2      | Regional contractual and legal regulation of the functioning of higher education institutions and their branches                                     | 77         |
| 3.3      | Contractual and legal regulation of the recognition of higher education qualifications at the regional level   | 85         |
| 3.3.1    | Recognition of qualifications within the CIS, EurAsEC  | 85         |
| 3.3.2    | Recognition of higher education qualifications in the EHEA   | 91         |
| 3.4      | EU law and higher education  | 96         |
| 3.5      | Conclusions on section III   | 102        |
| <b>4</b> | <b>PRACTICE OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN ON BILATERAL CONTRACTUAL and LEGAL REGULATION OF INTERSTATE RELATIONS IN THE FIELD OF HIGHER EDUCATION</b> | <b>104</b> |
| 4.1      | The right to higher education and academic mobility as an object of bilateral contractual and legal regulation                                       | 105        |
| 4.2      | Bilateral contractual and legal regulation of the functioning of higher education institutions   | 118        |
| 4.3      | Bilateral contractual and legal basis for the recognition of higher education qualifications   | 128        |
| 4.4      | Conclusions on section IV  | 139        |
|          | <b>CONCLUSION</b>  | <b>146</b> |
|          | <b>REFERENCES</b>  | <b>152</b> |